

Terms of Reference

Project title:	Support to Adult Education in Central Asia
Country:	Kyrgyzstan
Project number:	8290
Funding agency:	BMZ

1 Introduction

DVV International is the Institute for International Cooperation of the Deutscher Volkshochschul-Verband e.V. (DVV), the German Adult Education Association. DVV represents the interests of approximately 920 adult education centres (Volkshochschulen) and their state associations, the largest service provider of continuing education in Germany. As the leading professional organisation in the field of adult education and development cooperation, DVV International has committed itself to supporting lifelong learning for 50 years now. DVV International provides worldwide support for the establishment and development of sustainable structures for a lifelong Adult Learning and Education (ALE).

Funded in a large part by the BMZ for the creation/strengthening of social structures (Sozialstrukturförderung - SSF), the Institute cooperates with more than 200 partners in more than 30 countries in Africa, Asia, Latin America, and Europe. DVV International promotes, together with national, regional, and global associations of adult learning and education (ALE), lobbying and advocacy activities for the human right to education and lifelong learning. In doing so, DVV International contributes to the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the Global Agenda for Education (Education 2030) and the UNESCO International Conferences on Adult Education (CONFINTEA).

DVV International supports the exchange of information and interaction between professionals at European and global level through conferences, seminars, and publications. DVV International's interventions cover three levels: *first level* – contribution to policies, strategies, standards and norms, as well as funding on national level (macro level), *second level* – institutional capacity building and capacity building of teaching staff (meso level), and, *third level* - the basic model interventions for the population with potential for replication at national, regional, and international level (micro level).

2 Background of the Project

DVV International has been supporting adult education and lifelong learning in Kyrgyzstan since 2002 and cooperates with both state and non-state actors. Among the state partners in the current project phase are the State Service of Penitentiary Execution and the Vocational Training Department of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic as well as the State Universities in Bishkek and Osh. The non-governmental partners include the Kyrgyz Adult Education

Association (KAEA) as well as the Association of Public Libraries together with their member organizations, the Institute for Youth Development, Youth of Osh, and AFEW. DVV International's programming offers labour market-oriented skills development courses, civic education courses, and training programmes in conflict management and prevention of violent extremism for socially disadvantaged groups, such as the unemployed, prisoners and ex-prisoners, women, and youth from rural areas in all regions of Kyrgyzstan. Various formats of non-formal training are offered, including clubs, exhibitions, lectures, and discussions through the network of Adult Training Centers. In addition, DVV International in Kyrgyzstan supports capacity development for adult education institutions in the areas of educational provision, management, and financial and organizational sustainability, and thus contributes to improving the quality and accessibility of adult education offers in the country. Through policy advice, studies, and exchange of best practices in the field of adult education and lifelong learning, DVV International also contributes to improving the framework for adult education in the Kyrgyz education sector.

3 Objectives of the Project

The following are general objectives of DVV International:

- (1) Adult learning and education offers are improved and multiplied (micro level);
- (2) The technical and institutional capacities of the cooperation partners for carrying out practical activities and for the management of a system are reinforced (meso level);
- (3) The inclusion of adult learning and education in policies, poverty reduction strategies and local and national budgets has increased (macro level).

4 Activities of the Programme

The usual DVV International programme phase is 9 years. These 9 years are divided into 3 phases of 3 years: 2018 – 2020 (phase I), 2021-2023 (phase II), and 2024 – 2026 (phase III).

The **overall objective** for the **project phase 2018 – 2020** was: Through diversification of ALE providers and programmes as well as an increased quality of services, the access of socially disadvantaged target groups to needs-based ALE and LLL services has improved, and the experience gained has been taken into account at the macro level.

The **overall objective** for the current **project phase 2021 – 2023** is: The policy framework for adult learning and education has been improved based on best practices and lessons learned from a network of education providers and contributes to the achievement of the SDGs in Kyrgyzstan.

The programme has set the following objectives on the meso level to contribute to achieving the overall objectives in the project phase 2018 – 2020 and 2021 – 2023:

Meso level objectives 2018 – 2020

1. Selected partners (including new ALE actors) are able to offer qualitatively improved or diversified ALE programmes at the end of the project period with improved sustainability potential.
2. ALE specialists have access to high quality and nationally recognised education and training in ALE.

Meso level objectives 2021 – 2023

1. At least one education provider is able to offer training of trainers (ToT) based on Curriculum globALE, including e-learning for adult educators.
2. Two networks of ALE providers are professionalised in their strategic planning and PR capacities.

3. An increasing number of ALE providers is connected in a network, professionalised, and provides diverse and high-quality education services based on local needs assessments, including for particularly marginalised target groups.

With the objective to sustainably develop social structures for adult learning and education, DVV International's programs aim to have an impact on three levels (micro, meso, and macro) in accordance with the above-mentioned objectives.

5 Evaluation Goal and Objectives

DVV International understands itself as a learning organization. In order to improve further project activities, DVV International, as the implementing agency, would like to learn more about achievements, challenges, and best practices of the above mentioned project with special attention to the meso level, in the past 2,5 years.

The purpose of this evaluation is twofold.

First, an **ex-post evaluation** of the **project phase 2018-2020** should focus on the **meso level** and review and assess the relevance of the project activities, the achievement of the expected results, and pay special attention to their **impact** and perspectives of **sustainability** 18 months after the end of the project phase.

Second, an **evaluation of the current midterm status** of the **project phase 2021 – 2023** should critically assess the achievement of the objectives laid out in the initial proposal and to what extent the objectives and activities contribute to the above mentioned objectives on the meso level. The indicator which should inform the overarching guiding questions for this evaluation has been formulated in the project planning matrix as follows: "By February 2023, an external assessment confirms concrete progress in institutional change, including organisational and financial sustainability of ALE providers, particularly in terms of networking, diversity as well as quality of education and needs orientation." In addition, the **uptake of recommendations** from the end of project evaluation conducted in 2020 in the current project phase should be critically assessed.

Lessons learnt and recommendations on objectives and activities should be formulated for both parts of the evaluation. These learnings and recommendations will serve to inform the conceptualization and planning of methodologies, strategies, and approaches for further activities in the next project phase, which will be prepared starting fall 2022.

The evaluation should consider all possible sources (secondary and primary sources) of information and triangulate the different information sources to achieve high quality and valid data. This data shall enable the evaluator to provide evidence-based conclusions and feasible and realistic recommendations.

The evaluation and its recommendations shall be a useful tool of information for the project implementing agency – DVV International and its partners.

6 Main Evaluation Questions

The evaluation must be carried out according to the OECD DAC Criteria for Evaluation Development Assistance and additional criteria. It should give clear statements regarding the following:

6.1 Relevance

The extent to which the aid activity is suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient, and donor. In evaluating the relevance of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

- To what extent are the objectives of the programme still valid?
- Are the activities and outputs of the programme consistent with the overall goal and the attainment of its objectives?
- Are the activities and outputs of the programme consistent with the intended impacts and effects?

6.2 Effectiveness

A measure of the extent to which an aid activity attains its objectives. In evaluating the effectiveness of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

- To what extent were the objectives achieved / are likely to be achieved?
- What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?

6.3 Impact

The positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended, or unintended. This involves the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental, and other development indicators. The examination should be concerned with both intended and unintended results and must also include the positive and negative impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions. When evaluating the impact of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

- What has happened as a result of the programme or project?
- What real difference has the activity made to the beneficiaries?
- How many people have been affected?

6.4 Sustainability

Sustainability is concerned with measuring whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn. Projects need to be environmentally as well as financially sustainable. When evaluating the sustainability of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

- To what extent did the benefits of a programme or project continue after donor funding ceased?
- What were the major factors which influenced the achievement or non-achievement of sustainability of the programme or project?

6.5 Coherence

This criterion captures a perspective that was not covered previously. A lack of coherence can lead to duplication of efforts and undermine overall progress. Adding the criteria will help raise the bar on analysis of these important issues. Coherence deals with the compatibility of the intervention with other interventions in a country, sector or institution.

- Internal coherence:
 - Are there synergies and interlinkages between the intervention and other interventions carried out by the same institution?
- External coherence:
 - Are the interventions consistent, harmonized and coordinated with the interventions of other actors in the same context?
 - Do the interventions complement each other?
 - Are duplication of efforts being avoided?

6.6 Learning

- To what extent have recommendations from the end of project evaluation conducted in 2020 been taken up?
- What are major improvements across the two project phases and which challenges remain?

7 Evaluation Approach and Methods

The evaluation will consist of both desk and field study. A combination of primary data collection and secondary data review is expected during the evaluation.

Secondary data sources will be made available to the contractor. The following **secondary documents** will be provided:

- Project proposal
- Interim project reports
- Mid-term and other kinds of (self)evaluations referring to the project
- Partner documents of project implementation (as far as available)
- Etc.

To collect information from **primary data sources**, the contractor is free to propose feasible methodological approaches (quantitative or qualitative). We recommend taking the following groups into consideration:

- Management (including financial management) of regional and country office of DVV I,
- Senior management in the head office

Institutional capacity of partners:

- Stakeholders from partner institutions (in different regions)
- Trainers and teachers

Effectiveness with regard to the target group:

- Learners,
- Families of learners (also from previous years) schools and
- Employers etc. (depending on the programme design)

It should be checked if standardized quantitative approaches might be applicable.

The evaluation will begin with an inception phase of reviewing documents provided by DVV International (desk study), and the preparation of an inception report. This is followed by a period of field study and the preparation of a draft report. The final report will consider remarks to the draft report made by the DVV International country, regional office, and regional desk at headquarters.

8 Indicative Timetable and Work Input

The indicative number of working days foreseen is 22, which will include the following steps:

- 1 day total of briefing and debriefing (online or face-to-face);
- 4 days of document review;
- 1 day preparation of inception report;
- 10 days of field mission in Kyrgyzstan (Bishkek, Osh, Naryn, and Issyk Kul)
- 5 days of report drafting;
- 1 day of report finalization.

Please take the indicative distribution of working days into account in your suggestions regarding the evaluation methodology. It is up to the contractor to make alternative suggestions, depending on

the evaluation approach and methodology chosen. The field phase is supposed to take place in September. The first draft evaluation report will be due by 15 October, and the final version by mid-November.

9 Target Group of the Evaluation Results

The target group of the evaluation results will be the project management team of DVV International country and regional office as well as the head office in Bonn. The results of the evaluation will also be sent to the Contracting Authority (BMZ). Furthermore, the results of the evaluation will also be presented to local partners.

10 Right of Use

The Principal has the exclusive and unlimited right to use the results fulfilled by the contract. The transfer of this Right of Use is complete with the payment made to the Contractor.

The Contractor has Right of Use permission strictly limited for personal non-commercial purposes. Transfer of the Right of Use to third parties is excluded.

11 Contractual Conditions

The legal basis for this contract is provided by the „General terms and conditions for the implementation of Services" (VOL/B). These general terms and conditions are not attached to this contract; however, an exemplary service contract is part of these Terms of Reference for perusal.

12 Tasks of the Evaluator/ Evaluation Team

The evaluation team will be requested to fulfil the following tasks:

- Methodological design and planning of the evaluation in communication with DVV International;
- Desk Study of relevant project documentation (application and logframe, annual plans and reports, other monitoring documents and project reports, teaching and PR material);
- Design of data collection instruments for the field phase;
- Prepare an Inception Report;
- Conduct the field phase with participation and involvement of all relevant stakeholders;
- Compile preliminary evaluation report, integrate comments, and finalize the report.
- De-briefing sessions, possibly in country of evaluation and/or Bonn, Germany

13 Deliverables

The following deliverables are expected:

- **Inception report:** The expert/ team of experts will present a report giving detailed information about methods and specified questions (evaluation matrix); all data collection tools need to be presented beforehand. In case of applying quantitative data collection methods, a pre-test will be required. This report will be presented to DVV International; DVV International will provide feedback in due time and may request amendments. The Inception Report needs to be approved by DVV International before the data collection commences.

- **Debriefing in the country:** By arrangement with the DVV International programme coordinator, the (team of) expert(s) will present the preliminary, country-specific results of the evaluation and will answer questions in this regard, documenting the discussion, which must form part of the final report.
- **Draft evaluation report:** DVV International will receive a first draft of the final report, which will be examined based on the DAC Evaluation Quality Standards; on this basis, comments will be made on the rough draft before it is returned to the expert(s).
- **Final evaluation report:** The final report will consider the comments on the rough draft about the entire evaluation process and all results and recommendations.

The evaluation report should be produced **in English** and submitted to DVV International **electronically**. A respective template for the final report will be provided in the inception phase to the contractor.

14 Responsible Persons at DVV International and Logistics

DVV International will be the contracting authority for this evaluation. The main contact persons will be

- The senior manager for monitoring and evaluation of DVV International, Bonn
- The senior desk officer for Central & South Asia of DVV International in Bonn
- DVV International's Regional Director for Central Asia
- DVV International Country Director, Kyrgyzstan

The DVV country office will provide all relevant documents and support the evaluator/ team of evaluators in the field with arranging interviews and field visits etc.

The final report will be accepted by the senior manager for monitoring and evaluation and the senior desk officer for Central & South Asia of DVV International in Bonn.

15 Evaluator Eligibility Criteria

The consultant(s) we are looking for should

- have at least 5-year experience in the field of evaluation of development projects (please, provide proof of this experience);
- be able to demonstrate sound knowledge of evaluation methods and instruments;
- be (an) experienced professional(s) in the field of adult education,
- have experience with organisational development and capacity development,
- have experiences with stakeholder participation and transparent knowledge management;
- analytical and writing skills;
- knowledge of and previous working experience in Central Asia
- fluency in English and Russian is an asset;

16 Quality Standards

The candidates should propose a suitable evaluation design and methodology, well adapted to the project objectives and TOR for the evaluation, to meet the evaluation's goal and objectives.

The evaluation must comply with the following standards and guidelines:

- OECD-DAC Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance¹
- Standards of the DeGEval – Gesellschaft für Evaluation Standards für Evaluation²

17 Coordination/Responsibility

The Senior Desk Officer for Central & South Asia as well as the Senior Desk Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation at DVV International Headquarters in Bonn will oversee the contracting. The evaluator should work in close cooperation with DVV International Country Director in Kyrgyzstan during the preparatory and implementation phase. Relevant project documentation and data as well as logistic support (booking of accommodation, local transportation, translation, and assistance in arranging interviews and project visits) will be provided by the DVV International Country Office in Kyrgyzstan.

18 Application package

Experts participating in the tender for this evaluation should send the application package by **latest 22.08.2022** by e-mail to:

Dr. Thomas Lichtenberg (Senior Manager on Monitoring and Evaluation at DVV International Headquarters in Bonn), e-mail address: Lichtenberg@dvv-international.de

Kathleen Glenz (Senior Desk Officer for Central & South Asia at DVV International Headquarters in Bonn), e-mail address: glenz@dvv-international.de

Dr. Nicola Vöhringer (Regional Officer for Adult Learning and Education), e-mail address: mailto:voehringer@dvv-international.de

Nadezhda Romanenko (Country Director Kyrgyzstan, DVV International), e-mail address: romanenko@dvv-international.kg

Late submissions will not be accepted.

The application package should include the following documents. Please make sure to comply to the provided requirements below and use the **annexed templates**:

All interested candidates should submit the following documents:

- a) CV(s) of person(s) to be involved in the assignment in English (Please use the template provided);
- b) Technical proposal covering the following aspects (**maximum of 5 pages**);
 - Narrative overview displaying an understanding of the task
 - Detailed methodology
 - Work Plan, including detailed proposed steps of implementation
 - Consideration of any specific requirements envisaged for the evaluation
 - Consideration of the specific context (country, topic)
 - Internal Quality Management
- c) A detailed financial proposal with all expected costs (Please use the template provided and submit with a **hand-written signature**).

¹ <http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/qualitystandardsfordevelopmentevaluation.htm>

² <https://www.degeval.org/publikationen/standards-fuer-evaluation>

19 Evaluation criteria of proposals

The proposals will be assessed according to the following criteria:

- **Qualifications of the evaluation team (counts one third)** (based on criteria mentioned above);
- **Technical proposal (counts one third)** (based on criteria mentioned above; all of the above mentioned criteria for technical proposals will be taken into account);
- **Financial proposal (counts one third)** (best cost-service relation; please consider the envisaged total number of working days).

20 Request for clarification

If you should have questions concerning this tender, please send your questions to Dr. Thomas Lichtenberg mentioned as contact person, above. The **latest date for submitting questions is 16 August 2022**. The answers to the questions will be published on our website (<https://www.dvv-international.de/dvv-international/stellenangebote/>) for all interested parties the following day.